

# Notice of Allowability

Application No.

09/668,125

Examiner

Vanel Frenel

Applicant(s)

TRIBBLE, ROB

Art Unit

3627

## -- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address--

All claims being allowable, PROSECUTION ON THE MERITS IS (OR REMAINS) CLOSED in this application. If not included herewith (or previously mailed), a Notice of Allowance (PTOL-85) or other appropriate communication will be mailed in due course. **THIS NOTICE OF ALLOWABILITY IS NOT A GRANT OF PATENT RIGHTS.** This application is subject to withdrawal from issue at the initiative of the Office or upon petition by the applicant. See 37 CFR 1.313 and MPEP 1308.

1. ☒ This communication is responsive to 7/3/07.
2. ☒ The allowed claim(s) is/are 1-4, 6-11, 13-18, 20 and 21.
3. ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
  - a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some\* c) ☐ None of the:
    1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
    2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
    3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this national stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* Certified copies not received: \_\_\_\_\_.

Applicant has THREE MONTHS FROM THE "MAILING DATE" of this communication to file a reply complying with the requirements noted below. Failure to timely comply will result in ABANDONMENT of this application.

**THIS THREE-MONTH PERIOD IS NOT EXTENDABLE.**

4. ☐ A SUBSTITUTE OATH OR DECLARATION must be submitted. Note the attached EXAMINER'S AMENDMENT or NOTICE OF INFORMAL PATENT APPLICATION (PTO-152) which gives reason(s) why the oath or declaration is deficient.
  5. ☐ CORRECTED DRAWINGS ( as "replacement sheets") must be submitted.
    - (a) ☐ including changes required by the Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review ( PTO-948) attached
      - 1) ☐ hereto or 2) ☐ to Paper No./Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_.
    - (b) ☐ including changes required by the attached Examiner's Amendment / Comment or in the Office action of Paper No./Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_.
- Identifying indicia such as the application number (see 37 CFR 1.84(c)) should be written on the drawings in the front (not the back) of each sheet. Replacement sheet(s) should be labeled as such in the header according to 37 CFR 1.121(d).
6. ☐ DEPOSIT OF and/or INFORMATION about the deposit of BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL must be submitted. Note the attached Examiner's comment regarding REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEPOSIT OF BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL.

## Attachment(s)

1. ☐ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
2. ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
3. ☐ Information Disclosure Statements (PTO/SB/08), Paper No./Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_
4. ☐ Examiner's Comment Regarding Requirement for Deposit of Biological Material

5. ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application
6. ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413), Paper No./Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_
7. ☐ Examiner's Amendment/Comment
8. ☒ Examiner's Statement of Reasons for Allowance

9. ☒ Other Drawings submitted 2/6/2001  
are approved.

## **DETAILED ACTION**

### **Notice to Applicant**

1. This communication is in response to the Appeal Brief filed on 7/3/07. Claims 1-4, 6-7, 8-11, 13-18 and 20-21 are pending.

### ***Allowable Subject Matter***

2. Claims 1-4, 6-11, 13-18, and 20-21 are allowed. The following is an Examiner's statement of reasons for allowance and light of Applicant's arguments.

Independent claims 1, 8 and 15 are directed to "wherein said rule engine uses business rules to evaluate a relationship between said business objects; wherein each business object is a voter that provides votes that are evaluated by said business rules; providing rule resolution strategy means for resolving conflicts between specific preferences of voters and determining a correct solution set; and wherein a sequence of voters and an order of the votes included for each voter determine values in said solution set".

The closest prior art of record, Marsh et al (4,210,962) teaches processor for dynamic programming.

Chisholm (5,400,248) teaches computer network based conditional voting system.

However, none of the cited prior art above fairly teaches/ suggests "wherein said rule engine uses business rules to evaluate a relationship between said business objects; wherein each business object is a voter that provides votes that are

evaluated by said business rules; providing rule resolution strategy means for resolving conflicts between specific preferences of voters and determining a correct solution set; and wherein a sequence of voters and an order of the votes included for each voter determine values in said solution set".

Claims 2-4, 6-7, 9-11, 13-14, 16-18 and 20-21 incorporate the features of claims 1, 8 and 15 through their dependencies, and are also allowed for the same reasons given above.

3. Any comments considered necessary by applicant must be submitted no later than the payment of the issue fee and, to avoid processing delays, should preferably accompany the issue fee. Such submissions should be clearly labeled "Comments on Statement of Reasons for Allowance."

#### ***Conclusion***

4. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Vanel Frenel whose telephone number is 571-272-6769. The examiner can normally be reached on 6:30am-5:00pm.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Zeender Ryan Florian can be reached on 571-272-6790. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Art Unit: 3627

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

V.F

September 14, 2007

 9/17/07  
F. RYAN ZEENDER  
SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER